The Neuroimmune Basis of Anti-inflammatory Acupuncture

Ben Kavoussi, MS, and B. Evan Ross, DOM, LAc

This review article presents the evidence that the anti-inflammatory actions of acupuncture are mediated via the reflexive central inhibition of the innate immune system. Both laboratory and clinical evidence have recently shown the existence of a negative feedback loop between the autonomic nervous system and the innate immunity. There is also experimental evidence that the electrical stimulation of the vagus nerve inhibits macrophage activation and the production of TNF, IL-1β, IL-6, IL-18, and other proinflammatory cytokines. It is therefore conceivable that along with hypnosis, meditation, prayer, guided imagery, biofeedback, and the placebo effect, the systemic anti-inflammatory actions of traditional and electro-acupuncture are directly or indirectly mediated by the efferent vagus nerve activation and inflammatory macrophage deactivation. In view of this common physiological mediation, assessing the clinical efficacy of a specific acupuncture regimen using conventional double-blind placebo-controlled trials inherently lacks objectivity due to (1) the uncertainty of ancient rules for needle placement, (2) the diffuse noxious inhibitory control triggered by control-needling at irrelevant points, (3) the possibility of a dose-response relationship between stimulation and effects, and (4) the possibility of inadequate blinding using an inert sham procedure. A more objective assessment of its efficacy could perhaps consist of measuring its effects on the surrogate markers of autonomic tone and inflammation. The use of acupuncture as an adjunct therapy to conventional medical treatment for a number of chronic inflammatory and autoimmune diseases seems plausible and should be validated by confirming its cholinergicity.

Keywords: innate immunity; acupuncture; electro-acupuncture; chronic inflammatory disease; cholinergic anti-inflammatory pathway; vagus nerve; acetylcholine; heart rate variability; cytokines; tnf; interleukins

There are many fields—I shall call them proto-sciences—in which practice does generate testable conclusions but which nevertheless resemble philosophy and the arts rather than the established sciences. . . . In these fields, too, though they satisfy Sir Karl’s demarcation criterion, incessant criticism and continual striving for a fresh start are primary forces, and need to be.

—Thomas Kuhn (1922-1996)

Background

Acupuncture is an ancient healing art that has survived and evolved in the Far East (China) and is currently flourishing in the US and in Europe both as primary and adjunctive therapy for a variety of chronic conditions. It consists of inserting needles at various skin depths into specific points, and stimulating them manually or with a low-voltage electrical current, and heating them with a mugwort incense—according to the tradition—or with a heat lamp—in the modern practice. It might be practiced in conjunction with skin scraping (gua sha) or cupping. Laser has recently been used instead of heated needles, but its efficacy remains controversial.2,3

Acupuncture is presumed to have its origins in blood ritual, magic tattooing, and body piercing associated with shamanic healing performed during the Neolithic Age (8000-5000 BC) for the purpose of restoring health and safety and protection against demonic infestation and malevolence.4,5 Sharpened stones and bones discovered in China that have been dated to around 6000 BC and that have been interpreted as acupuncture instruments6,7 might very well have been used for ritual bloodletting or even for lancinating abscesses.8,5 The shamanic healing hypothesis is further supported by the presence of nonfigurative tattoos on the “Tyrolean Ice Man,” a Neolithic native inhabitant of the Oetztal Alps, whose naturally preserved 5200-year-old body displays a set of small cross-shaped tattoos that correspond to current Chinese acupuncture points. Medical imaging shows that the middle-aged man suffered from lumbar arthropathy. The tattoos are located at points traditionally indicated for this condition.10,11

The animistic health and safety beliefs of Neolithic shamans have evolved in the Far East into a mechanistic system of therapeutic needling for the adjustment of the vital flow of a putative subtle substance called...
Qi (pronounced “chee”), that is believed to circulate in a network of 12 primary “channels,” also called “tracks,” or “meridians,” which, like stellar constellations, connect 360 principle points. This art has been practiced in China for thousands of years along with herbal medicine and manipulative therapy (tui-ná) and has been conceptualized according to ancient metaphysics, alchemy, astrology, Chinese humoral medicine, numerology, and geomancy (feng shui). Nonetheless, in the 1950s a portion of this vast array of heterogeneous beliefs that were compatible with Marxist dialectical materialism (Yin-Yang theory, etc) was selected and artificially incorporated to create a makeshift medical system to serve the political and public health needs of post-Mao China. It is this makeshift body of knowledge that has been flourishing in the US as “Oriental” or “Traditional Chinese Medicine.”

In 1997, the NIH published a Consensus Development Conference Statement summarizing the known actions of acupuncture and acknowledging its efficacy in adult postoperative and chemotherapy nausea and vomiting and in postoperative dental pain. It also acknowledged its value as an alternative or adjunct treatment for the management of pain and/or inflammation in a variety of conditions such as “addiction, stroke rehabilitation, headache, menstrual cramps, tennis elbow, fibromyalgia, myofascial pain, osteoarthritis, low back pain, carpal tunnel syndrome, and asthma.” In a large scale study funded by the National Center for Complementary and Alternative Medicine (NCCAM), Berman et al reported the specific benefits of acupuncture for pain relief and functional improvement for knee osteoarthritis. However, there are also many studies that dispute the efficacy of specific acupuncture regimens in pain relief beyond the placebo effect and argue that studies in favor of acupuncture have thus far remained poorly designed and biased.

Although no single theory has been successful in offering a unified physiological explanation for its effects, many have proposed that the analgesic actions of acupuncture may involve the prevention of pain perception due to a saturation phenomenon that Melzack and Wall have called the “gate control theory.” An innate mechanism of rebound analgesia after an acute noxious stimulus from the needle, heat, or stimulation, which is called “counter-irritation,” “counter-stimulation,” or “diffuse noxious inhibitory control” (DNIC), has also been proposed. The acupuncture-induced DNIC is believed to be mediated by the release of endogenous opioid neuropeptides and/or monoaminergic neurotransmitters, mainly because naloxone, a central and peripheral opioid receptor antagonist, is reported to reverse its effects. DNIC is believed to rely on spino-bulbo-spinal loops that involve the ascending neural pathways in the anterolateral spinal columns, integration in the lower brain stem, and descending influences reaching the dorsal horn neurons via the dorsolateral quadrant of the spinal cord. As for the reported anti-inflammatory actions, they have been attributed to an endogenous “counter-inflammation” phenomenon known since the antiquity, in which the effects of a local inflammatory reaction are known to decrease an inflammation at a distant site. Counterinflammation was extensively studied by Fauve et al in the 1980s, who showed in mice that it has an effect equivalent or superior to that of glucocorticoids.

The Neuroimmune Evidence

An important insight into the physiology of endogenous counterinflammatory mechanisms came from the past 2 decades of research on the pathogenesis of acute inflammation, hypercytokinemia, and fatality associated with severe sepsis and septic shock. Observation and experimentation have shown that the brain and the innate immune system form a bidirectional network via both the neural and humoral pathways, in which the immune system operates as a sensory organ to inform the brain about inflammation and tissue injury, and the brain in return orchestrates a limited and localized inflammatory response. This process starts when unmyelinated sensory C fibers found in all major tissues and organs in response to a stimulus release substance P and other proinflammatory tachykinins, induce vasodilation, and increase vascular permeability and leukocyte margination (Figure 1).

According to Matthay and Ware, these peripheral inflammatory events constitute danger signals that are conveyed via a fast transmission pathway involving the afferent vagus nerve to the viscero sensory nucleus tractus solitarius in the brainstem, and also via a slow transmission pathway involving cytokines originating from the choroid plexus and circumventricular organs and diffuse into the brain by volume transmission. The resulting acute stress response from the sympathetic nervous system is mediated directly by the nerve-to-immune-cell interaction, or indirectly by the adrenal neuroendocrine axis. The binding of catecholamine outflow to the β2-adrenergic receptors expressed on immune cells leads to a decrease in proinflammatory (TNF, IL-1β, IL-6, and IL-18) and an increase in anti-inflammatory (IL-10) cytokines, thus controlling the extent of the inflammatory response. The signal is also relayed to the hypothalamus and the dorsal vagal complex to stimulate the release of ACTH, thereby activating the humoral anti-inflammatory pathway (Figure 1).
Nonetheless, both laboratory and clinical evidence have shown that it is the parasympathetic nervous system that plays the leading role in the down-regulation of cytokine synthesis and the containment of somatic inflammation. The vagal outflow, which innervates the major organs (including those containing the monocyte-macrophage system, also known as the reticuloendothelial system), has so far been known as the autonomic outflow that keeps the resting heart rate at 60 to 80 bpm and controls the digestive and hormonal activities. Tracey et al found that it also plays a systemic immunoregulatory and homeostatic role called the “cholinergic anti-inflammatory pathway” (Figure 2).

They have identified an α7 nicotinic acetylcholine receptor (α7nAChR) expressed on tissue macrophages, to which vagal acetylcholine (ACh) binds in the monocyte-macrophage system to inhibit the synthesis of proinflammatory but not the anti-inflammatory cytokines (Figure 2). They have reported that nanomolar concentrations of ACh are sufficient to inhibit the production of proinflammatory cytokines in human macrophage cultures challenged with lipopolysaccharide (LPS). Also, experimental vagotomy in animals is reported to show a significant exacerbation of TNF responses to LPS challenge, causing animals to rapidly succumb to shock.

The parasympathetic origin of the nonspecific anti-inflammatory actions of acupuncture is supported by the observation that the direct electrical stimulation of the efferent vagus nerve in LPS-challenged wild-type mice inhibits the synthesis of TNF in organs rich in cells of the monocyte-macrophage system. Tracey et al also reported that in models of murine acute inflammation and paw swelling, vagus nerve stimulation inhibited the inflammatory response and suppressed the development of swelling. Experimental evidence also indicates that the stimulation of the efferent vagus nerve dampens macrophage activation in rodent models of endotoxemia and shock. More recently, de Jonge et al used a rat model of postoperative ileus to show that stimulation of the cholinergic anti-inflammatory pathway also attenuates intestinal inflammation and improves gastric motility. The molecular mechanism of this anti-inflammatory effect seems to involve the pathway of the tyrosine kinase Jak2 and the transcription factor STAT3, which is activated via the a7nAChR expressed on gastrointestinal acrophages. In contrast, vagal stimulation is reported to have no effect in knockout mice.
mice deficient in macrophage α7nAChR expression, suggesting that it is the binding of vagal ACh to α7nAChR that initiates the down-regulation of innate immunity.44-46

The cholinergic anti-inflammatory pathway proposed by Tracey et al could therefore provide a very plausible physiological mechanism for the reported anti-inflammatory actions of acupuncture.47-49 This pathway would also explain the reported actions of ear acupuncture (auriculotherapy) in treating the symptoms of opiate withdrawal. According to Ulett and Han, the conchea of the ear is the only place on the surface of the body where the vagus nerve could easily be stimulated to produce a "broad parasympathetic effect."25 The cholinergic anti-inflammatory pathway could also explain the reported antipyretic actions of acupuncture, which are believed to be mediated by the down-regulation of 2 specific cytokines, IL-6 and IL-1β.50 Moreover, sections of the Stomach and Spleen meridians known to generate parasympathetic stimuli nearly correspond to the known vagus nerve pathways in the supradiaphragmatic and subdiaphragmatic viscera (Figures 3 and 4).51

This association would equally explain why, as shown by Teruo Matsumoto in 1974, the stimulation of ST-36, a key point on the Stomach channel (Zusanli, 3 inches below the inferior border of the patella and 1 inch lateral to the anterior crest of the tibia), induced peristalsis in postoperative ileus, both in rabbits and in men, and it also reduced the increased peristalsis of the colon after the administration of cholecystokinin 8 (CCK8).25,52 Noguchi and Hayashi reported in 1996 that the stimulation of ST-36 in anesthetized rats
caused a marked gastric acid enhancement but no response in the rats after vagotomy. They also reported a response amplification after the removal of the spleen, an organ of the monocyte-macrophage system. These results suggested that the stimulation of ST-36 increased gastric acid secretion with somatic nerves as the afferent pathway and branches of the vagus nerve to the stomach as the efferent pathway.55

The Epistemological Significance

The systemic inhibition of innate immunity via the parasympathetic outflow as proposed by Tracey et al could ultimately be viewed as the cohesive physiological pathway that would explain the anti-inflammatory actions of an array of nonpharmaceutical modalities, ranging from acupuncture to hypnosis, meditation, prayer, guided imagery, biofeedback, and even the placebo effect (Figure 3).41 This correlation between acupuncture and placebo directly challenges the objectivity of conventional double-blind placebo-controlled trials for assessing the clinical efficacy of a specific regimen. First, observations by JS Han have indicated that frequencies of stimulation in electroacupuncture are of greater importance than the ancient rules for needle placement.44,45 Then, Middlekauff et al have confirmed that even needles placed at irrelevant points could have broad physiological effects, “although perhaps to a lesser degree.”56 The control-induced DNIC therefore remains an inherent objectivity issue in acupuncture placebo-controlled trials. Also, the possibility of a dose-response relationship between stimulation and the activation of the cholinergic anti-inflammatory pathway is probable but remains unknown. Finally, the possibility of inadequate blinding using an inert sham procedure might trigger DNIC effects and that an entirely inert control procedure would have been largely preferable. Moreover, neither Berman et al nor the critics have addressed the possibility of a dose-response relationship between acupuncture stimulation and the activation of the cholinergic anti-inflammatory pathway. Perhaps, if Berman et al had inserted 9 needles instead of 2 in the first control group, especially in the vicinity of the vagus nerve’s subdiaphragmatic pathway as they inadvertently did (Figures 3 and 4), they would have obtained results comparable to that of their treatment group. It is also possible that the effects obtained in the treatment group are predominantly due to the electrical stimulation. The smaller European study conducted by Vas et al (88 patients) avoided the possibility of DNIC effects by using an entirely inert sham control, but it also has been questioned for a potential subjectivity in blinding, in that control patients may have become aware of their group assignment.57

Inasmuch as assessing the anti-inflammatory actions of a specific acupuncture regimen with conventional placebo-controlled studies inherently lacks objectivity, a paradigm shift to embrace current research methodologies in experimental immunology is reasonably conceivable. The purpose of a study would then shift to measuring its cholinergeticity by determining its effects on the established surrogate markers of autonomic tone, such as the high-frequency spectral component of the instantaneous heart rate variability (HRV).38,39 Given the reported direct effects of acupuncture on HRV, this approach seems justifiable.60,61 Perhaps the methodology used by Goldstein et al to measure the HRV and the extent of macrophage activation in patients with rheumatoid arthritis could serve as a model.62 Their study rationale has been the fact that patients with sepsis, rheumatoid arthritis, lupus, inflammatory bowel disease, and other cytokine-mediated diseases have an impaired parasympathetic tone, which could be observed through an increase in their heart rate and a decrease in their HRV.65-72 In rheumatoid arthritis, Goldstein et al have also observed an associated macrophage activation, which was determined by measuring the levels of serum cytokines after an in vitro LPS-challenge.64

Conclusion

Despite its premodern concepts, the Chinese therapeutic principle of adjusting and harmonizing the internal
elemental/organic environment to achieve stability parallels the modern notion of reestablishing homeostasis by regulating the interactions between the autonomic nervous system, the innate immunity, and several other systems. Ulett and Han have further suggested that certain homeostatic effects of acupuncture and auriculotherapy might be directly explained by the “broad parasympathetic effects” of the vagus nerve. The cholinergic anti-inflammatory pathway provides simple, cohesive, and integrative biomedical evidence for the systemic immunoregulatory actions of acupuncture and auriculotherapy, in view of which, their use as an adjunct therapy to conventional medical treatment for a number of cytokine-mediated diseases is plausible.

Recent research also indicates that many cancers arise from sites of infection, chronic irritation, and inflammation, and that inflammation is a critical component of tumor progression. Coussens and Werb report that the tumor microenvironment, which is largely orchestrated by inflammatory cells, is an indispensable participant in the neoplastic process, fostering proliferation, survival, and migration. In addition, tumor cells have co-opted some of the signaling molecules of the innate immune system, such as selectins, chemokines, and their receptors for invasion, migration, and metastasis. These insights could therefore provide a stimulus for further research in the use of acupuncture in oncology beyond alleviating the nausea and vomiting associated with chemotherapy.

Finally, the evidence presented in this article is predominantly based on laboratory research and must be validated by translational investigation. Only clinical trials that confirm acupuncture’s ability to increase the autonomic tone and ACh output while decreasing inflammatory molecules (cytokines, CRP, ESR, etc) could ultimately establish its association with the cholinergic anti-inflammatory pathway and determine its clinical efficacy in treating inflammatory and autoimmune diseases.

Acknowledgments

The authors thank James D. Adams Jr, Chul Koo, Sarah le Jeune, Ju-Tzu Li, William Morris, Timothy Rogers, Alex Tremeau-Bravard, Jay Udani, and George Ulett for their valued and encouraging comments. This review was not funded, and the authors have no conflicting financial interests to disclose.

References


256